



Analysis of Patterns of Employment by Race in Baltimore City and the Baltimore Metropolitan Area

PREPARED FOR ASSOCIATED BLACK CHARITIES

Jing Li, MPP RESEARCH ANALYST THE JACOB FRANCE INSTITUTE Richard Clinch, PhD DIRECTOR THE JACOB FRANCE INSTITUTE

Contents

- 3 A Letter from the CEO
- 4 **Executive Summary**
- 6 Patterns of Industry Employment, By Race
- 14 Analysis of Wage, Employment Growth and Turnover in the Baltimore Metropolitan Area and Baltimore City
- 21 Analysis of Occupational Employment in the Baltimore Metropolitan Area and Baltimore City
- 30 Industry and Occupational Growth Projections and the African American Workforce



A Letter from the CEO

There have been countless studies highlighting the economic disparities that exist between Blacks and Whites with wealth disparities at the forefront of the conversation today. For example, a report released by Prosperity Now (2017) found that the median household income for African-Americans in Baltimore is nearly half that of whites, \$33,801 compared to \$62,751. A similar report (also released by Prosperity Now, 2017) found that if the average Black family wealth continues to grow at the same pace it has over the past three decades, it would take Black families 228 years to amass the same amount of wealth White families have today. Despite how startling these facts are, what's even more startling is the seeming lack of connection between wealth and patterns of employment (attachment, turnover and advancement or lack thereof). We are clear that employment is not wealth, however employment and advancement provides stability that leads to the resources needed to access wealth building tools such as home ownership. If we only look at the wealth disparities and do not look deeper and disaggregate employment attachment data by race, we will not be able to fully address the challenges that exist and create more comprehensive strategies to remove the racialized barriers and support the economic mobility of African Americans in our City.

ABC aspires to see a Baltimore where racialized structural barriers to economic opportunities for African Americans have been eliminated. With this as our bold goal we have narrowed our focus on workforce and the workforce ecosystem understanding that if we are not working in partnership with policy makers, employers, funders, advocates, workforce practitioners and individual workers we will not be able to dismantle the systems that perpetuate these disparities through their racialized policies and practices. We are clear that in order to affect change for our African American residents, we need to understand the current employment landscape before we can create a strategy to address the systemic and institutional racialized barriers that continue to keep people of color locked out of opportunities.

To that end, ABC commissioned the Jacob France Institute (JFI) to examine African American employment attachment and turnover in Baltimore City and the Baltimore Metro region. This report, filled with data on attachment, turnover and wages by race (White and Black) should be used to inform any strategies or decisions that will impact the economic outcomes of African American workers in our City. If the majority of Baltimore City residents are of color (63.3%); we are led to ask why it is that this very same majority has been generationally attached to low wage, low skill jobs? This chronic attachment to low-wage/low-skill jobs not only hurts the individuals but it also hurts the larger economy, and perpetuates the cycle of poverty that exists in communities of color. We are hoping that this report will serve as a clear example that the time is now to make real change needed for our own economic viability as a City.

Sincerely,

Diane Bell-McKoy

Diane Bell-McKoy President and CEO

The Racial Wealth Divide in Baltimore, Prosperity Now – formerly CFED (2017). https://prosperitynow.org/files/PDFs/profiles/Racial_Wealth_Divide_in_Baltimore_RWDI.pdf

Executive Summary

This analysis will present data on racial differences in employment, employment growth, earnings and job turnover. Our analysis answers the question – Is African-American employment concentrated in lower-paying or higher-turnover sectors of the City and regional economy? African American employment is concentrated in lower wage industries and occupations and African American workers tended to earn less than their white counterparts and experience higher employment turnover. We identified four industries with high numbers or concentrations of African American employment: retail trade; transportation and warehousing; health care and social assistance; and administrative and support and waste management services. These four industries have lower wages than many competing sectors. Moreover, racial wage disparities generally persisted across industries and occupations, and become starker in advanced industries that also had an underrepresentation of African American employment, such as manufacturing, wholesale trade, management of companies and enterprises, and professional, scientific, and technical services. Industries with high concentrations of African American employment are mixed in terms of turnover rates; however, turnover among African American workers is higher across all industries in both the metro area and in the City.

However, African American employment experienced faster post-recession growth than white employment

across all industries. This is especially true in Baltimore City, where African American employment grew by 14% and white employment fell; with African American employment increasing by 19 percent in the overall Baltimore metropolitan area compared to 4 percent growth in white employment. Three of the four industries with high concentrations of African American employment: transportation and warehousing; health care and social assistance; and administrative and support and waste management services; experienced strong overall post-recession (2009-16) job growth, and African American employment also grew rapidly in the expanding management of companies and enterprises sector. African American employment in the professional, scientific, and technical services sector grew, but the concentration of African American workers in this important sector remains lower than national average and that of white workers. African American gains in the professional, scientific, and technical

services sector are important because this is the core sector that drives the State, regional and City economies and offers higher than average wages. Increasing the penetration of African American workers in this sector will have the dual impact of offering higher wage employment opportunities as well as better integrating African American workers into the core driver of the regional economy.

Selected key findings of the racial disparity analysis on employment are as follows:

- Racial wage disparities generally exist across industries, in nearly every industry. Median African American earnings are below industry average and tend to be well below those of their white counterparts.
- African American employment experienced faster post-recession growth than total and white employment across nearly all industries.
- At the industry level, African American employment is concentrated in higher turnover industries. More troubling, the turnover rate for African American workers is higher than both the industry average and the rate for white workers across industries. Stable employment is a key prerequisite of financial stability, and therefore, understanding the causes of the differential rate of African American employee turnover is an area of key interest.
- African American employment tends to be concentrated more in lower wage/lower skill occupations. This may explain the persistent racial wage/turnover gaps across industries.
- In terms of projected employment growth, industries with a strong African American presence are expected to experience stronger employment growth; however, many of the occupations with higher concentrations of African American workers are expected to experience slower growth.

Patterns of Industry Employment, By Race

The JFI analyzed patterns of employment by race in the Baltimore Metropolitan area and in Baltimore City to assess differences in employment by industries.

Some key findings are as follows:

As shown in Table 1a and 1b, African American employment is more highly concentrated in four sectors:

1

Retail Trade

which accounts for 14% of African American employment in the metro area and 17% of employment in Baltimore City;

C Transportation and

Baltimore City;

warehousing which accounts for 6% of African American employment in the metro area and 3% of employment in

Health care and social assistance

which accounts for 25% of African American employment in the metro area and 28% of employment in Baltimore City;



of African American employment in the metro area and 15% of employment in Baltimore City; and

Together these four sectors account for 58% of African American employment compared to 43% of all jobs in the Metropolitan area and for 63% of African American jobs in the City, compared to 46% of all City jobs.

African American employment in the construction and professional, scientific, and technical services¹ sectors significantly lags overall and white employment in these sectors.

These differences are important for several reasons. First, as will be described below, wages tend to be lower in the sectors where African American employment is concentrated. The professional, scientific, and technical services sector, where the share of African American workers is less than half that of white workers, is the region's leading sector and offers high wage opportunities to a large number of workers. The construction sector, where the share of African American forty percent that of white workers, provides a large base of middle skill jobs offering above-average earnings opportunities.

1 The Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services sector comprises establishments that specialize in performing professional, scientific, and technical activities for others. These activities require a high degree of expertise and training. The establishments in this sector specialize according to expertise and provide these services to clients in a variety of industries and, in some cases, to households. Activities performed include: legal advice and representation; accounting, bookkeeping, and payroll services; architectural, engineering, and specialized design services; computer services; consulting services; research services; advertising services; photographic services; translation and interpretation services; veterinary services; and other professional, scientific, and technical services. See - https://www. census.gov/cgi-bin/sssd/naics/naicsrch?code=54&search=2017 NAICS Search. This sector is the core driver of the State, regional and City economies.

Industries	Total	% of Total	White alone	% of Total White	Black or African American alone	% of Total AA
Civilian employed population 14 years and over	<u>1,137,347</u>	<u>100%</u>	<u>723,912</u>	<u>100%</u>	<u>319,436</u>	<u>100%</u>
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting, and mining:	2,396	0.2%	2,074	0.3%	211	0.1%
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting	2,013	0.2%	1,763	0.2%	149	0.0%
Mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction	383	0.0%	311	0.0%	62	0.0%
Construction	76,399	7%	62,722	9%	10,063	3%
Manufacturing	54,865	5%	38,835	5%	11,623	4%
Wholesale trade	54,020	5%	39,632	5%	10,744	3%
Retail trade	143,930	13%	84,896	12%	45,638	14%
Transportation and warehousing, and utilities:	52,406	5%	29,274	4%	20,245	6%
Transportation and warehousing	47,198	4%	25,248	3%	19,330	6%
Utilities	5,208	0%	4,026	1%	915	0%
Information	18,144	2%	11,746	2%	5,130	2%
Finance and insurance, and real estate and rental and leasing:	77,100	7%	54,287	7%	18,273	6%
Finance and insurance	54,141	5%	39,382	5%	11,202	4%
Real estate and rental and leasing	22,959	2%	14,905	2%	7,071	2%
Professional, scientific, and management, and administrative and waste management services:	235,824	21%	150,464	21%	64,547	20%
Professional, scientific, and technical services	124,802	11%	92,443	13%	18,999	6%
Management of companies and enterprises	14,041	1%	9,076	1%	3,933	1%
Administrative and support and waste management services	96,981	9%	48,945	7%	41,615	13%
Educational services, and health care and social assistance:	242,882	21%	135,453	19%	87,791	27%
Educational services	45,395	4%	32,332	4%	8,820	3%
Health care and social assistance	197,487	17%	103,121	14%	78,971	25%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation, and accommodation and food services:	135,698	12%	83,550	12%	36,199	11%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation	25,387	2%	17,663	2%	5,664	2%
Accommodation and food services	110,311	10%	65,887	9%	30,535	10%
Other services, except public administration	43,683	4%	30,979	4%	8,972	3%

Table 1a: Private Sector Employment by Sector, by Race 2016 for the Baltimore Metropolitan Area

Industries	Total	% of Total	White alone	% of Total White	Black or African American alone	% of Total AA
Civilian employed population 14 years and over	<u>331,568</u>	<u>100%</u>	207,879	100%	<u>99,503</u>	100%
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting, and mining:	501	0.2%	436	0.2%	42	0.0%
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting	432	0.1%	389	0.2%	21	0.0%
Mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction	69	0.0%	47	0.0%	21	0.0%
Construction	23,571	7%	19,740	9%	2,790	3%
Manufacturing	13,568	4%	9,666	5%	3,068	3%
Wholesale trade	12,401	4%	9,491	5%	2,310	2%
Retail trade	50,174	15%	29,154	14%	16,761	17%
Transportation and warehousing, and utilities:	8,964	3%	5,354	3%	3,299	3%
Transportation and warehousing	7,487	2%	4,301	2%	2,922	3%
Utilities	1,477	0%	1,053	1%	377	0%
Information	5,813	2%	3,414	2%	2,089	2%
Finance and insurance, and real estate and rental and leasing:	32,097	10%	22,762	11%	7,625	8%
Finance and insurance	24,179	7%	17,435	8%	5,326	5%
Real estate and rental and leasing	7,918	2%	5,327	3%	2,299	2%
Professional, scientific, and management, and administrative and waste management services:	66,224	20%	41,100	20%	20,063	20%
Professional, scientific, and technical services	30,107	9%	22,451	11%	4,554	5%
Management of companies and enterprises	4,257	1%	3,004	1%	968	1%
Administrative and support and waste management services	31,860	10%	15,645	8%	14,541	15%
Educational services, and health care and social assistance:	71,103	21%	36,900	18%	29,512	30%
Educational services	8,663	3%	6,728	3%	1,396	1%
Health care and social assistance	62,440	19%	30,172	15%	28,116	28%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation, and accommodation and food services:	34,753	10%	20,713	10%	9,741	10%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation	5,662	2%	4,147	2%	1,226	1%
Accommodation and food services	29,091	9%	16,566	8%	8,515	9%
Other services, except public administration	12,399	4%	9,149	4%	2,203	2%

Table 1b: Private Sector Employment by Sector, by Race 2016 for Baltimore City

The first section of this report focuses on racial disparities in the City and metro area by analyzing the share of employment by industry and by race. This section looks at regional racial disparities in industry concentrations in terms of the concentration of employment, using location quotients (LQs). Specifically, we use LQs to analyze the degree to which employment is concentrated in certain industries in the Baltimore Metropolitan Area and City, compared to the nation as a whole. By using LQs, the JFI can measure the level of employment concentration in an industry for the City or region as compared to the national average. An LQ greater than 100 indicates higher concentration in a particular industry than the national average. When an LQ is 1.2 or above – a region is generally considered specialized in that industry. In this report we use LQs to analyze industry concentrations for total workers, white workers, and African American workers, in the Baltimore Metro Area and in the City.

The results of the LQ analysis are presented in Tables 2a and 2b. Below are some of our most important findings:

African American workers have a higher concentration (LQ) of employment in the four industries that account for a large share of overall African American employment:

- The metro area industry LQ for African American employment in the retail sector is 108.7

 indicating African Americans have an almost 9% higher concentration of employment in this sector than the concentration of employment for workers nationally. The concertation in the City is even higher, 128.2 indicating a concentration of employment 28 percent higher than the national average.
- The metro area industry LQ for African American employment in the transportation and warehousing sector is 152.6 indicating African Americans have a more than 50% higher concentration of employment in this sector than workers nationally. The total and African American employment concertation in this sector in the City is lower than the national average indicating that much of this employment is located in the surrounding counties.
- In the healthcare and social assistance sector, where the Baltimore metro area has an above average concentration of employment and in Baltimore City, which is specialized in this sector; the employment concentration of African American employment is 157.3 (57% above the national average) in the metro area, and 179.7 (nearly 80% above the national average) in City.
- The employment concentration of African American workers in the administrative and support and waste management services sector, is 177.7 (almost 80% higher than the U.S.) in the metro area, and 199.3 (almost twice the national average) in the City.

African American employment tends to be underrepresented in industries with middle to high skills and mid to high earnings. For example:

- While the region and City both have high concentrations of employment in the middle skill, middle wage construction sector, the concentration of African American employment in this sector is below national average and about one-third of the concentration of white employment, indicating a significant under-representation of African American employment in this sector.
- Other industries that reported lower concentrations of African American employment in both the metro area and the City include: manufacturing, wholesale trade, management of companies and enterprises, and professional, scientific, and technical services.
- In the professional, scientific, and technical services sector which drives the Maryland, regional and City economies, the concentration of African American employment in this sector is below national average and a fraction of the concentration of white employment.

White employment tends to be more highly concentrated in industries with mid to high skills and mid to high earnings.

- The construction sector has a much higher concentration of white employment, a LQ of 160.8 in the metro area and 176.3 in the City for white workers compared to an African American LQ of 58.5 and 52.0 respectively.
- In the City, white resident employment is more highly concentrated in industries with advanced skills and high wages, such as finance and insurance, real estate and rental and leasing, and professional, scientific, and technical services.

The low concentration of African-American employment in professional and technical services is problematic given that this sector is the driver of the State and regional economy and offers high wages.

Table 2a:	Private Sector Industry Location Quotient by Sector, by Race 2016 for the Baltimore
	Metropolitan Area

Baltimore Metro Industry LQ	Total	White alone	Black or African American alone
Civilian employed population 14 years and over		0 5	
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting, and mining:	14.2	19.3	4.4
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting	18.6	25.6	4.9
Mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction	6.3	8.1	3.6
Construction	124.7	160.8	58.5
Manufacturing	46.3	51.5	35.0
Wholesale trade	96.7	111.4	68.4
Retail trade	96.3	89.2	108.7
Transportation and warehousing, and utilities:	104.0	91.3	143.0
Transportation and warehousing	104.6	87.9	152.6
Utilities	98.5	119.7	61.6
Information	64.7	65.8	65.1
Finance and insurance, and real estate and rental and leasing:	101.7	112.5	85.8
Finance and insurance	96.9	110.8	71.4
Real estate and rental and leasing	114.9	117.2	126.0
Professional, scientific, and management, and administrative and waste management services:	123.9	124.2	120.8
Professional, scientific, and technical services	148.1	172.4	80.3
Management of companies and enterprises	61.9	62.9	61.8
Administrative and support and waste management services	116.3	92.2	177.7
Educational services, and health care and social assistance:	117.9	103.3	151.8
Educational services	167.4	187.3	115.8
Health care and social assistance	110.4	90.6	157.3
Arts, entertainment, and recreation, and accommodation and food services:	94.3	91.2	89.6
Arts, entertainment, and recreation	127.6	139.5	101.3
Accommodation and food services	89.0	83.5	87.7
Other services, except public administration	106.6	118.8	78.0

Baltimore City Industry LQ		White alone	Black or African American alone
Civilian employed population 14 years and over			
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting, and mining:	10.2	14.1	2.8
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting	13.7	19.6	2.2
Mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction	3.9	4.2	4.0
Construction	132.0	176.3	52.0
Manufacturing	39.3	44.7	29.6
Wholesale trade	76.1	92.9	47.2
Retail trade	115.2	106.7	128.2
Transportation and warehousing, and utilities:	61.0	58.1	74.8
Transportation and warehousing	56.9	52.2	74.0
Utilities	95.8	109.0	81.5
Information	71.1	66.6	85.1
Finance and insurance, and real estate and rental and leasing:	145.2	164.2	114.9
Finance and insurance	148.5	170.8	109.0
Real estate and rental and leasing	136.0	145.9	131.6
Professional, scientific, and management, and administrative and waste management services:	119.4	118.2	120.5
Professional, scientific, and technical services	122.6	145.8	61.8
Management of companies and enterprises	64.4	72.5	48.8
Administrative and support and waste management services	131.0	102.6	199.3
Educational services, and health care and social assistance:	118.4	98.0	163.8
Educational services	109.5	135.7	58.8
Health care and social assistance	119.8	92.3	179.7
Arts, entertainment, and recreation, and accommodation and food services:	82.8	78.7	77.4
Arts, entertainment, and recreation	97.6	114.0	70.4
Accommodation and food services	80.5	73.1	78.5
Other services, except public administration	103.8	122.1	61.4

Table 2b: Private Sector Industry Location Quotient by Sector, by Race 2016 for Baltimore City

Analysis of Wage, Employment Growth and Turnover in the Baltimore Metropolitan Area and Baltimore City

Analysis of Wage, Employment Growth and Turnover in the Baltimore Metropolitan Area and Baltimore City

African American workers face a wage gap.

Four industries: retail trade; transportation and warehousing; health care and social assistance; and administrative and support and waste management services; account for both a high share of African American employment and have higher-than-national-average concentrations of African American employment. These four industries tend to offer lower levels of median wages than other industry sectors. Moreover, industries that offer higher wages, such as utilities, finance and insurance, and professional, scientific and technical services tend to have lower concentrations of African American employment. More troubling, there exists a broad racial wage gap, with median African American earnings lagging both the industry median earnings and significantly lagging their white counterparts across industries.

Industries - African American Employment	Total Employm ent	% of Total Employment	Industry LQ	Median Earnings- Total	Median Earnings- White alone	Median Earnings-Black or African American alone
Civilian employed population 14 years and over	319,435	100%		\$58,440	\$66,612	\$38,798
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting, and mining:	211	0.1%	4.4	\$53,160	\$54,816	\$44,430
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting	149	0.0%	4.9	\$39,780	\$40,824	\$31,284
Mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction	62	0.0%	3.6	\$66,540	\$68,808	\$57,576
Construction	10,063	3%	58.5	\$62,400	\$64,980	\$48,576
Manufacturing	11,623	4%	35.0	\$76,356	\$83,832	\$54,336
Wholesale trade	10,744	3%	68.4	\$78,372	\$85,776	\$52,488
Retail trade	45,638	14%	108.7	\$33,252	\$37,560	\$25,680
Transportation and warehousing, and utilities:	20,245	6%	143.0	\$85,698	\$94,194	\$61,968
Transportation and warehousing	19,330	6%	152.6	\$53,052	\$64,740	\$37,116
Utilities	915	0%	61.6	\$118,344	\$123,648	\$86,820
Information	5,130	2%	65.1	\$83,520	\$92,748	\$60,708
Finance and insurance, and real estate and rental and leasing:	18,273	6%	85.8	\$85,668	\$97,956	\$51,372
Finance and insurance	11,202	4%	71.4	\$108,768	\$122,964	\$61,656
Real estate and rental and leasing	7,071	2%	126.0	\$62,568	\$72,948	\$41,088
Professional, scientific, and management, and administrative and waste management services:	64,547	20%	120.8	\$73,512	\$82,916	\$49,368
Professional, scientific, and technical services	18,999	6%	80.3	\$94,500	\$98,928	\$71,664
Management of companies and enterprises	3,933	1%	61.8	\$83,724	\$98,832	\$45,792
Administrative and support and waste management services	41,615	13%	177.7	\$42,312	\$50,988	\$30,648
Educational services, and health care and social assistance:	87,791	27%	151.8	\$58,722	\$63,972	\$41,316
Educational services	8,820	3%	115.8	\$66,336	\$69,360	\$45,780
Health care and social assistance	78,971	25%	157.3	\$51,108	\$58,584	\$36,852
Arts, entertainment, and recreation, and accommodation and food services:	36,199	11%	89.6	\$31,092	\$31,404	\$30,432
Arts, entertainment, and recreation	5,664	2%	101.3	\$40,464	\$40,032	\$41,604
Accommodation and food services	30,535	10%	87.7	\$21,720	\$22,776	\$19,260
Other services, except public administration	8,972	3%	78.0	\$40,368	\$43,272	\$33,528

Table 3a: Private Sector Wage Disparities by Sector, by Race 2016 for the Baltimore Metropolitan Area

Industries - African American Employment	Total Employment	% of Total Employment	Industry LQ	Median Earnings- Total	Median Earnings- White alone	Median Earnings-Black or African American alone
Civilian employed population 14 years and over	<u>99,503</u>	<u>100%</u>		\$62,820	<u>\$76,992</u>	<u>\$38,688</u>
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting, and mining:	42	0.0%	2.8	\$47,052	\$45,450	\$47,130
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting	21	0.0%	2.2	\$40,716	\$41,556	\$33,936
Mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction	21	0.0%	4.0	\$53,388	\$49,344	\$60,324
Construction	2,790	3%	52.0	\$62,424	\$65,340	\$45,780
Manufacturing	3,068	3%	29.6	\$66,408	\$72,276	\$48,444
Wholesale trade	2,310	2%	47.2	\$76,188	\$83,424	\$47,112
Retail trade	16,761	17%	128.2	\$33,480	\$38,232	\$25,500
Transportation and warehousing, and utilities:	3,299	3%	74.8	\$71,166	\$76,560	\$59,634
Transportation and warehousing	2,922	3%	74.0	\$49,548	\$55,152	\$40,920
Utilities	377	0%	81.5	\$92,784	\$97,968	\$78,348
Information	2,089	2%	85.1	\$73,560	\$81,492	\$60,648
Finance and insurance, and real estate and rental and leasing:	7,625	8%	114.9	\$85,272	\$97,536	\$50,016
Finance and insurance	5,326	5%	109.0	\$104,928	\$118,944	\$58,668
Real estate and rental and leasing	2,299	2%	131.6	\$65,616	\$76,128	\$41,364
Professional, scientific, and management, and administrative and waste management services:	20,063	20%	120.5	\$68,960	\$77,968	\$43,816
Professional, scientific, and technical services	4,554	5%	61.8	\$79,200	\$82,716	\$57,564
Management of companies and enterprises	968	1%	48.8	\$87,000	\$100,188	\$45,672
Administrative and support and waste management services	14,541	15%	199.3	\$40,680	\$51,000	\$28,212
Educational services, and health care and social assistance:	29,512	30%	163.8	\$45,210	\$50,892	\$32,064
Educational services	1,396	1%	58.8	\$43,500	\$45,540	\$30,888
Health care and social assistance	28,116	28%	179.7	\$46,920	\$56,244	\$33,240
Arts, entertainment, and recreation, and accommodation and food services:	9,741	10%	77.4	\$30,798	\$29,508	\$36,264
Arts, entertainment, and recreation	1,226	1%	70.4	\$40,908	\$36,912	\$54,732
Accommodation and food services	8,515	9%	78.5	\$20,688	\$22,104	\$17,796
Other services, except public administration	2,203	2%	61.4	\$37,848	\$40,776	\$29,688

Table 3b: Private Sector Wage Disparities by Sector, by Race 2016 for Baltimore City

Data Source: Longitudinal Employer-Household Dynamics, Census Bureau

African American employment is growing more rapidly than both the regional total and for white workers.

Next, we turn to the patterns of employment growth. We analyzed employment growth by race and African American employment seems to be growing faster both in total and across most industries. Analyzing growth rates before 2009, all the way back to 2001, confirms that this trend began before 2009, and therefore does not signify that more recent growth in African American employment results from this population having been more significantly impacted by the recession.

In both the Baltimore metro area and the City, three of the four industries that account for a high share of African American employment and have a high LQ for African American workers: retail trade; transportation and

warehousing; health care and social assistance; and administrative and support and waste management services; have all experienced strong post-recession overall employment growth. The fourth, retail trade grew in the region but declined slightly in the City; however African American employment in this sector grew in both the City and region, while white employment in this sector fell. The stronger growth of African American employment in some particularly high-paying industries is also a bright spot. For example, African American employment experienced very strong growth in the Management of Companies (139% in the metro area and 48% in the City). In the professional, scientific and technical services sector which drives the regional economy, African American employment increased

Thus, in both the City and the metro area, African American employment seems to be benefitting from the national recovery.

more rapidly than both the industry total and for white workers.

Table 4a:Private Sector Post-Recession (2009–2016) Employment Growth by Sector, by Race for the
Baltimore Metropolitan Area

Industries - African American Employment	Total Employment	% of Total Employment	Industry LQ	Employment Growth - Total	Employment Growth - White alone	Employment Growth - Black or African American alone
Civilian employed population 14 years and over	319,436	<u>100%</u>	-	10%	4%	19%
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting, and mining:	211	0.1%	4.4	20%	24%	12%
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting	149	0.0%	4.9	15%	18%	6%
Mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction	62	0.0%	3.6	57%	73%	29%
Construction	10,063	3%	58.5	7%	5%	14%
Manufacturing	11,623	4%	35.0	(16%)	(19%)	(10%)
Wholesale trade	10,744	3%	68.4	0%	(4%)	12%
Retail trade	45,638	14%	108.7	5%	(3%)	20%
Transportation and warehousing, and utilities:	20,245	6%	143.0	26%	12%	46%
Transportation and warehousing	19,330	6%	152.6	30%	15%	49%
Utilities	915	0%	61.6	(3%)	(5%)	9%
Information	5,130	2%	65.1	(20%)	(14%)	(34%)
Finance and insurance, and real estate and rental and leasing:	18,273	6%	85.8	1%	(1%)	3%
Finance and insurance	11,202	4%	71.4	(1%)	(3%)	(1%)
Real estate and rental and leasing	7,071	2%	126.0	7%	4%	11%
Professional, scientific, and management, and administrative and waste management services:	64,547	20%	120.8	25%	17%	40%
Professional, scientific, and technical services	18,999	6%	80.3	17%	12%	23%
Management of companies and enterprises	3,933	1%	61.8	68%	46%	139%
Administrative and support and waste management services	41,615	13%	177.7	32%	23%	43%
Educational services, and health care and social assistance:	87,791	27%	151.8	11%	7%	14%
Educational services	8,820	3%	115.8	6%	4%	2%
Health care and social assistance	78,971	25%	157.3	12%	7%	15%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation, and accommodation and food services:	36,199	11%	89.6	20%	12%	35%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation	5,664	2%	101.3	40%	20%	120%
Accommodation and food services	30,535	10%	87.7	16%	10%	26%
Other services, except public	8,972	3%	78.0	6%	4%	6%

Table 4b:Private Sector Post-Recession (2009–2016) Employment Growth by Sector, by Race for
Baltimore City

Industries - African American Employment	Total Employment	% of Total Employment	Industry LQ	Employment Growth - Total	Employment Growth - White alone	Employment Growth - Black or African American alone
Civilian employed population 14 years and over	<u>99,503</u>	<u>100%</u>		4%	(2%)	14%
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting, and mining:	42	0%	2.8	22%	21%	20%
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting	21	0%	2.2	29%	29%	31%
Mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction	21	0%	4.0	(12%)	(19%)	11%
Construction	2,790	3%	52.0	(2%)	(2%)	(6%)
Manufacturing	3,068	3%	29.6	(33%)	(35%)	(31%)
Wholesale trade	2,310	2%	47.2	3%	(2%)	18%
Retail trade	16,761	17%	128.2	(0%)	(9%)	14%
Transportation and warehousing, and utilities:	3,299	3%	74.8	22%	14%	36%
Transportation and warehousing	2,922	3%	74.0	22%	14%	35%
Utilities	377	0%	81.5	20%	12%	47%
Information	2,089	2%	85.1	(21%)	(18%)	(28%)
Finance and insurance, and real estate and rental and leasing:	7,625	8%	114.9	(1%)	(2%)	(2%)
Finance and insurance	5,326	5%	109.0	(1%)	(3%)	(3%)
Real estate and rental and leasing	2,299	2%	131.6	1%	1%	2%
Professional, scientific, and management, and administrative and waste management services:	20,063	20%	120.5	20%	13%	34%
Professional, scientific, and technical services	4,554	5%	61.8	10%	5%	19%
Management of companies and enterprises	968	1%	48.8	14%	4%	48%
Administrative and support and waste management services	14,541	15%	199.3	33%	28%	38%
Educational services, and health care and social assistance:	29,512	30%	163.8	7%	(2%)	16%
Educational services	1,396	1%	58.8	0%	(1%)	(7%)
Health care and social assistance	28,116	28%	179.7	8%	(2%)	18%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation, and accommodation and food services:	9,741	10%	77.4	11%	3%	23%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation	1,226	1%	70.4	14%	6%	51%
Accommodation and food services	8,515	9%	78.5	10%	3%	20%
Other services, except public administration	2,203	2%	61.4	6%	1%	22%

Data Source: Longitudinal Employer-Household Dynamics, Census Bureau

Next, we turn our attention to the patterns of employee turnover. Turnover measures the rate at which stable jobs begin and end. It is calculated by summing the number of stable hires in the reference quarter and stable separations in the next quarter, and dividing by the average full-quarter employment. This is the rate at which jobs steadily changed hands. Another term for this calculation is churning. We collected this data from the Quarterly Workforce Indicators (QWI) from the Census Bureau's program on Longitudinal Employer-Household Dynamics.

Turnover for African American workers is higher overall and generally higher across industries.

The turnover rate for African American workers is 12 percent in both the metro area and City, higher than both the overall and white rates in both areas. Among the four industries that account for a high share of African American employment and have a high LQ for African American workers: retail trade; transportation and warehousing; health care and social assistance; and administrative and support and waste management services; three (retail trade; transportation and warehousing and administrative and support and waste management services) have comparatively high rates of turnover, while the turnover rate for the health care and social assistance is low. Thus, African American employment is more concentrated in higher turnover industries; however and more importantly, the turnover rate for African American workers is higher across nearly all broad industry classifications. It is hard to evaluate whether a high turnover rate is bad for African American workers based on this data alone. However, the high turnover industries with high concentrations of African American employment also have low median earnings.

The picture of a high turnover rate for a low-paying job does not seem conducive to a stable financial life.

Industries - African American Employment	Total Employment	% of Total Employment	Industry LQ	Turnover -Total	Turnover -White alone	Turnover - Black or African American alone
Civilian employed population 14 years and over	319.436	100%		10%	<u>9%</u>	12%
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting, and mining:	211	0.1%	4.4	8%	8%	10%
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting	149	0.0%	4.9	10%	10%	14%
Mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction	62	0.0%	3.6	7%	7%	7%
Construction	10,063	3%	58.5	10%	9%	13%
Manufacturing	11,623	4%	35.0	5%	5%	7%
Wholesale trade	10,744	3%	68.4	7%	7%	9%
Retail trade	45,638	14%	108.7	11%	10%	14%
Transportation and warehousing, and utilities:	20,245	6%	143.0	6%	5%	9%
Transportation and warehousing	19,330	6%	152.6	10%	8%	13%
Utilities	915	0%	61.6	3%	2%	4%
Information	5,130	2%	65.1	7%	7%	7%
Finance and insurance, and real estate and rental and leasing:	18,273	6%	85.8	8%	7%	9%
Finance and insurance	11,202	4%	71.4	6%	6%	8%
Real estate and rental and leasing	7,071	2%	126.0	9%	8%	11%
Professional, scientific, and management, and administrative and waste management services:	64,547	20%	120.8	10%	9%	13%
Professional, scientific, and technical services	18,999	6%	80.3	8%	7%	11%
Management of companies and enterprises	3,933	1%	61.8	7%	6%	10%
Administrative and support and waste management services	41,615	13%	177.7	16%	13%	19%
Educational services, and health care and social assistance:	87,791	27%	151.8	8%	8%	9%
Educational services	8,820	3%	115.8	8%	8%	9%
Health care and social assistance	78,971	25%	157.3	8%	8%	9%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation, and accommodation and food services:	36,199	11%	89.6	15%	15%	16%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation	5,664	2%	101.3	14%	14%	15%
Accommodation and food services	30,535	10%	87.7	16%	16%	18%
Other services, except public administration	8,972	3%	78.0	10%	9%	11%

Table 5a Private Sector Employee Turnover by Sector, by Race for the Baltimore Metropolitan Area

Table 5b: Private Sector Employee Turnover by Sector, by Race for Baltimore City

Industries - African American Employment	Total Employmen t	% of Total Employmen t	Industry LQ	Turnover -Total	Turnover -White alone	Turnover Black or African American alone
Civilian employed population 14 years and over	<u>99,503</u>	100%		<u>9%</u>	<u>8%</u>	<u>12%</u>
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting, and mining:	42	0%	2.8	4%	4%	na
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting	21	0%	2.2	8%	7%	na
Mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction	21	0%	4.0	na	na	na
Construction	2,790	3%	52.0	10%	9%	14%
Manufacturing	3,068	3%	29.6	5%	5%	6%
Wholesale trade	2,310	2%	47.2	7%	6%	9%
Retail trade	16,761	17%	128.2	11%	10%	14%
Transportation and warehousing, and utilities:	3,299	3%	74.8	5%	4%	7%
Transportation and warehousing	2,922	3%	74.0	8%	7%	10%
Utilities	377	0%	81.5	2%	2%	4%
Information	2,089	2%	85.1	7%	7%	7%
Finance and insurance, and real estate and rental and leasing:	7,625	8%	114.9	7%	7%	9%
Finance and insurance	5,326	5%	109.0	6%	6%	7%
Real estate and rental and leasing	2,299	2%	131.6	9%	8%	11%
Professional, scientific, and management, and administrative and waste management services:	20,063	20%	120.5	10%	8%	13%
Professional, scientific, and technical services	4,554	5%	61.8	8%	7%	12%
Management of companies and enterprises	968	1%	48.8	6%	5%	8%
Administrative and support and waste management services	14,541	15%	199.3	16%	13%	19%
Educational services, and health care and social assistance:	29,512	30%	163.8	10%	9%	12%
Educational services	1,396	1%	58.8	11%	11%	14%
Health care and social assistance	28,116	28%	179.7	8%	7%	9%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation, and accommodation and food services:	9,741	10%	77.4	15%	15%	17%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation	1,226	1%	70.4	15%	15%	17%
Accommodation and food services	8,515	9%	78.5	16%	15%	18%
Other services, except public administration	2,203	2%	61.4	9%	8%	13%

Analysis of Occupational Employment in the Baltimore Metropolitan Area and Baltimore City

African American employment is less concentrated in higher skill/education occupations such as management, business, science, and arts occupations

Analysis of Occupational Employment in the Baltimore Metropolitan Area and Baltimore City

The JFI also analyzed employment by occupation for the total, white and African American population in the Baltimore Metropolitan Area and Baltimore City. It is important to note an important difference in the populations analyzed in the employment by industry analysis (above) and this analysis of occupational employment. The analysis of employment by industry is extracted from the Quarterly Wage Indicators (QWI) system from the U.S. Bureau of the Census, which covers only the private sector and excludes the public sector (government and military employment). This analysis of occupational employment; however, is based on U.S. Bureau of the Census, American Community Survey data, and includes all workers (public and private) and thus covers a broader population. Occupational employment data is also for workers by place of residence (where they live), while the employment by industry data analyzed above is by place of work (where they work).

A higher share of African Americans is employed in lower-skill occupations.

African American employment is less concentrated in higher skill/education occupations such as management, business, science, and arts occupations, as shown in Table 6a and 6b. This discrepancy is more severe in Baltimore City than in the metro area.

- In the Baltimore metro area, about half of all white residents are employed in management, business, science, and arts occupations, compared to only 36% of African Americans. In Baltimore City, the contrast is even starker, 58% of white residents are employed in these higher skill occupations, versus only 29% of African Americans.
- Management occupations have the largest racial gaps with much lower percentages of African American employment, in both the metro area and the City.
- For the computer, engineering, and science occupations; and education, legal, community service, arts, and media occupations; both have larger racial gaps in the City, but are more evenly distributed in the metro area.
- When we look at lower skill occupations, we find higher concentrations of African American employment in both the Baltimore metro area and Baltimore City.
- African American employment is disproportionately concentrated in the service-related occupations, which account for 24% of African American employment in the metro area, and 29% in the City, while these occupations account for a lower share of white employment (14% at the metro area and City level).
- African American employment also shows a similarly high concentration in both areas in sales and office occupations, but white employment in the same occupational groupings is comparable in the metro area.

Occupational Employment	Total	% of Total	White alone	% of Total White	Black or African American alone	% of Tota AA
Civilian employed population 16 years and over	1,417,201	100%	901,981	100%	378,343	100%
Management, business, science, and arts occupations:	652,278	46%	445,583	49%	137,222	36%
Management, business, and financial occupations:	254,605	18%	181,899	20%	49,515	13%
Management occupations	166,470	12%	123,115	14%	28,674	8%
Business and financial operations occupations	88,135	6%	58,784	7%	20,841	6%
Computer, engineering, and science occupations:	127,250	9%	86,103	10%	21,051	6%
Computer and mathematical occupations	76,032	5%	50,188	6%	13,929	4%
Architecture and engineering occupations	33,164	2%	24,064	3%	4,747	1%
Life, physical, and social science occupations	18,054	1%	11,851	1%	2,375	1%
Education, legal, community service, arts, and media occupations:	169,437	12%	117,839	13%	39,129	10%
Community and social services occupations	28,233	2%	14,014	2%	12,373	3%
Legal occupations	22,036	2%	17,293	2%	3,520	1%
Education, training, and library occupations	89,096	6%	64,253	7%	17,485	5%
Arts, design, entertainment, sports, and media occupations	30,072	2%	22,279	2%	5,751	2%
Healthcare practitioner and technical occupations:	100,986	7%	59,742	7%	27,527	7%
Health diagnosing and treating practitioners and other technical occupations	71,666	5%	44,770	5%	15,548	4%
Health technologists and technicians	29,320	2%	14,972	2%	11,979	3%
Service occupations:	238,907	17%	122,766	14%	91,073	24%
Healthcare support occupations	34,996	2%	11,128	1%	20,754	5%
Protective service occupations:	41,993	3%	19,294	2%	20,227	5%
Firefighting and prevention, and other protective service workers including supervisors	22,325	2%	10,105	1%	10,963	3%
Law enforcement workers including supervisors	19,668	1%	9,189	1%	9,264	2%
Food preparation and serving related occupations	67,004	5%	39,470	4%	18,642	5%
Building and grounds cleaning and maintenance occupations	45,010	3%	24,077	3%	16,446	4%
Personal care and service occupations	49,904	4%	28,797	3%	15,004	4%
Sales and office occupations:	312,319	22%	199,676	22%	87,908	23%
Sales and related occupations	124,961	9%	84,048	9%	28,957	8%
Office and administrative support occupations	187,358	13%	115,628	13%	58,951	16%
Natural resources, construction, and maintenance occupations:	93,814	7%	70,726	8%	15,135	4%
Farming, fishing, and forestry occupations	2,389	0%	2,159	0%	144	0%
Construction and extraction occupations	52,821	4%	40,531	4%	7,053	2%
Installation, maintenance, and repair occupations	38,604	3%	28,036	3%	7,938	2%
Production, transportation, and material moving occupations:	119,883	8%	63,230	7%	47,005	12%
Production occupations	41,894	3%	24,746	3%	12,658	3%
Transportation occupations	46,272	3%	23,714	3%	19,026	5%
Material moving occupations	31,717	2%	14,770	2%	15,321	4%

Table 6a: Occupational Employment, by Race 2016 for the Baltimore Metropolitan Area

Data Source: American Community Survey, Census Bureau

Table 6b: Occupational Employment, by Race 2016 for Baltimore City

Occupational Employment	Total	% of Total	White alone	% of Total White	Black or African American alone	% of Total AA
Civilian employed population 16 years and over	283,328	100%	108,599	<u>100%</u>	154,998	100%
Management, business, science, and arts occupations:	119,230	42%	63,029	58%	45,321	29%
Management, business, and financial occupations:	41,704	15%	22,098	20%	16,793	11%
Management occupations	25,840	9%	13,984	13%	10,495	7%
Business and financial operations occupations	15,864	6%	8,114	7%	6,298	4%
Computer, engineering, and science occupations:	19,435	7%	12,005	11%	4,811	3%
Computer and mathematical occupations	10,086	4%	6,018	6%	2,510	2%
Architecture and engineering occupations	3,963	1%	2,361	2%	1,256	1%
Life, physical, and social science occupations	5,386	2%	3,626	3%	1,045	1%
Education, legal, community service, arts, and media occupations:	38,242	13%	19,706	18%	15,878	10%
Community and social services occupations	8,266	3%	2,397	2%	5,614	4%
Legal occupations	4,348	2%	2,535	2%	1,594	1%
Education, training, and library occupations	19,552	7%	10,676	10%	6,991	5%
Arts, design, entertainment, sports, and media occupations	6,076	2%	4,098	4%	1,679	1%
Healthcare practitioner and technical occupations:	19,849	7%	9,220	8%	7,839	5%
Health diagnosing and treating practitioners and other technical occupations	13,051	5%	7,692	7%	2,878	2%
Health technologists and technicians	6,798	2%	1,528	1%	4,961	3%
Service occupations:	63,485	22%	14,874	14%	44,860	29%
Healthcare support occupations	11,200	4%	1,004	1%	9,992	6%
Protective service occupations:	9,716	3%	1,381	1%	7,844	5%
Firefighting and prevention, and other protective service workers including supervisors	5,680	2%	691	1%	4,637	3%
Law enforcement workers including supervisors	4,036	1%	690	1%	3,207	2%
Food preparation and serving related occupations	18,049	6%	6,261	6%	10,640	7%
Building and grounds cleaning and maintenance occupations	13,447	5%	3,254	3%	8,996	6%
Personal care and service occupations	11,073	4%	2,974	3%	7,388	5%
Sales and office occupations:	60,070	21%	19,219	18%	37,694	24%
Sales and related occupations	21,178	7%	8,306	8%	11,811	8%
Office and administrative support occupations	38,892	14%	10,913	10%	25,883	17%
Natural resources, construction, and maintenance occupations:	13,365	5%	5,236	5%	7,102	5%
Farming, fishing, and forestry occupations	69	0%	43	0%	0	0%
Construction and extraction occupations	9,086	3%	3,764	3%	4,497	3%
Installation, maintenance, and repair occupations	4,210	1%	1,429	1%	2,605	2%
Production, transportation, and material moving occupations:	27,178	10%	6,241	6%	20,021	13%
Production occupations	9,805	3%	3,031	3%	6,266	4%
Transportation occupations	10,206	4%	1,795	2%	8,260	5%
Material moving occupations	7,167	3%	1,415	1%	5,495	4%

Data Source: American Community Survey, Census Bureau

Continuing the methodology used in the industry analysis above, the JFI also used locational quotients (LQ) to measure the concentration of total, white and African American employment, by occupation, in the metro area and the City, as compared to the nation as a whole. Total, white and African American employment occupational LQs are calculated the same way as in the industry section above, based on national totals as denominator. So, the occupational LQ quantifies the concentration of total, white or African American employment in certain occupations, compared to total national employment. A LQ greater than 100 signifies that employment is more highly concentrated in a particular occupation than the national average for all workers.

African American employment is more concentrated in lower skill occupations.

At both the metro area and City levels, African American workers have a lower concentration of employment in key higher skill, higher wage management, business, science, and arts occupations than the regional or white total.

- Specifically, African American employment are significantly underrepresented in management, architecture and engineering, and life, physical and social sciences occupations where their concentration is a fraction of the employment concentration for white workers.
- Overall, the Baltimore region has an above-average concentration of employment in higher skill, higher education management, and business, science, and arts occupations than the national workforce, especially for white workers, and especially for white workers residing in Baltimore City. This signals missing opportunities for African American workers.
- Several high skill occupations stand out in terms of the concentration of African American employment at the metro area level. African American workers have a higher than national average share of employment in computer and mathematical occupations (an LQ of 124.3 signifying a concentration of employment 24% above the national average) and business and financial occupations (an LQ of 113.2). This signals the availability of an African American talent pool at the metro area level for computer, mathematical, business and financial occupations. However, in both cases these concentrations of employment are lower than that of their white counterparts.

African American employment is overrepresented in low-skill occupations such as: community and social services occupations; health technologists and technicians occupations; office and administrative support occupations; and transportation occupations; compared to national averages. This trend holds true for both the metro area and the City. Additionally, in the City, African American employment is overrepresented in service occupations.

Table 7a: Occupational Location Quotient by Race 2016 for the Baltimore Metropolitan Area

Occupational Employment LQ	Total	White alone	Black or African American alone
Civilian employed population 16 years and over	100.0	100.0	100.0
Management, business, science, and arts occupations:	122.5	131.5	96.5
Management, business, and financial occupations:	118.5	133.0	86.3
Management occupations	114.1	132.6	73.6
Business and financial operations occupations	127.8	133.9	113.2
Computer, engineering, and science occupations:	158.5	168.5	98.2
Computer and mathematical occupations	181.2	187.9	124.3
Architecture and engineering occupations	127.8	145.7	68.5
Life, physical, and social science occupations	146.1	150.7	72.0
Education, legal, community service, arts, and media occupations:	110.7	121.0	95.8
Community and social services occupations	115.7	90.2	189.9
Legal occupations	138.5	170.8	82.9
Education, training, and library occupations	105.7	119.7	77.7
Arts, design, entertainment, sports, and media occupations	105.9	123.3	75.9
Healthcare practitioner and technical occupations:	119.6	111.2	122.2
Health diagnosing and treating practitioners and other technical occupations	125.7	123.4	102.2
Health technologists and technicians	107.0	85.9	163.8
Service occupations:	93.2	75.3	133.1
Healthcare support occupations	104.8	52.4	232.9
Protective service occupations:	142.6	102.9	257.3
Firefighting and prevention, and other protective service workers including supervisors	138.2	98.3	254.3
Law enforcement workers including supervisors	147.9	108.6	261.0
Food preparation and serving related occupations	80.2	74.2	83.5
Building and grounds cleaning and maintenance occupations	80.3	67.5	109.9
Personal care and service occupations	92.7	84.1	104.4
Sales and office occupations:	94.4	94.9	99.6
Sales and related occupations	84.0	88.8	72.9
Office and administrative support occupations	103.0	99.9	121.4
Natural resources, construction, and maintenance occupations:	74.8	88.6	45.2
Farming, fishing, and forestry occupations	24.2	34.4	5.5
Construction and extraction occupations	73.9	89.1	37.0
Installation, maintenance, and repair occupations	87.6	100.0	67.5
Production, transportation, and material moving occupations:	69.6	57.7	102.2
Production occupations	51.3	47.6	58.1
Transportation occupations	87.1	70.1	134.2
Material moving occupations	84.7	62.0	153.3

Data Source: American Community Survey, Census Bureau

Occupational Employment LQ	Total	White alone	Black or African American alone
Civilian employed population 16 years and over	100.0	100.0	100.0
Management, business, science, and arts occupations:	112.0	154.5	77.8
Management, business, and financial occupations:	97.1	134.2	71.5
Management occupations	88.6	125.1	65.8
Business and financial operations occupations	115.0	153.5	83.5
Computer, engineering, and science occupations:	121.1	195.2	54.8
Computer and mathematical occupations	120.2	187.2	54.7
Architecture and engineering occupations	76.4	118.7	44.2
Life, physical, and social science occupations	218.1	383.0	77.3
Education, legal, community service, arts, and media occupations:	125.0	168.1	94.9
Community and social services occupations	169.4	128.2	210.3
Legal occupations	136.7	208.0	91.6
Education, training, and library occupations	116.0	165.3	75.8
Arts, design, entertainment, sports, and media occupations	107.1	188.4	54.1
Healthcare practitioner and technical occupations:	117.6	142.6	84.9
Health diagnosing and treating practitioners and other technical occupations	114.5	176.1	46.2
Health technologists and technicians	124.1	72.8	165.6
Service occupations:	123.9	75.7	160.0
Healthcare support occupations	167.8	39.2	273.7
Protective service occupations:	165.0	61.2	243.6
Firefighting and prevention, and other protective service workers including supervisors	175.9	55.8	262.5
Law enforcement workers including supervisors	151.8	67.7	220.5
Food preparation and serving related occupations	108.0	97.7	116.4
Building and grounds cleaning and maintenance occupations	119.9	75.7	146.7
Personal care and service occupations	102.9	72.1	125.5
Sales and office occupations:	90.9	75.8	104.2
Sales and related occupations	71.2	72.9	72.6
Office and administrative support occupations	106.9	78.3	130.1
Natural resources, construction, and maintenance occupations:	53.3	54.5	51.8
Farming, fishing, and forestry occupations	3.5	5.7	0.0
Construction and extraction occupations	63.6	68.7	57.5
Installation, maintenance, and repair occupations	47.8	42.3	54.1
Production, transportation, and material moving occupations:	78.9	47.3	106.3
Production occupations	60.0	48.4	70.1
Transportation occupations	96.1	44.1	142.2
Material moving occupations	95.8	49.3	134.2

Table 7b: Occupational Location Quotient by Race 2016 for Baltimore City

Data Source: American Community Survey, Census Bureau

3

African American employment is generally more highly concentrated in lower wage occupations.

In this section the JFI analyzes African American employment and employment concentration as compared to overall occupational median earnings for all workers across the metro area and City, to determine if African American employment is concentrated in lower wage occupations. Generally, African Americans have a higher concentration of and higher share of employment in lower wage occupations, especially in the City.

Occupational Employment - African American Employment	Total	% of Total	Occupational LQ	Overall Metro 2016 Median Earnings
Civilian employed population 16 years and over	378,343	100%	100.0	\$45,683
Management, business, science, and arts occupations:	137,222	36%	96.5	\$67,087
Management, business, and financial occupations:	49,515	13%	86.3	\$74,319
Management occupations	28,674	8%	73.6	\$77,441
Business and financial operations occupations	20,841	6%	113.2	\$68,791
Computer, engineering, and science occupations:	21,051	6%	98.2	\$90,607
Computer and mathematical occupations	13,929	4%	124.3	\$96,276
Architecture and engineering occupations	4,747	1%	68.5	\$86,384
Life, physical, and social science occupations	2,375	1%	72.0	\$61,793
Education, legal, community service, arts, and media occupations:	39,129	10%	95.8	\$49,332
Community and social services occupations	12,373	3%	189.9	\$44,563
Legal occupations	3,520	1%	82.9	\$82,176
Education, training, and library occupations	17,485	5%	77.7	\$46,716
Arts, design, entertainment, sports, and media occupations	5,751	2%	75.9	\$46,617
Healthcare practitioner and technical occupations:	27,527	7%	122.2	\$61,529
Health diagnosing and treating practitioners and other technical occupations	15,548	4%	102.2	\$71,996
Health technologists and technicians	11,979	3%	163.8	\$40,314
Service occupations:	91,073	24%	133.1	\$22,291
Healthcare support occupations	20,754	5%	232.9	\$27,818
Protective service occupations:	20,227	5%	257.3	\$51,985
Firefighting and prevention, and other protective service workers including supervisors	10,963	3%	254.3	\$38,009
Law enforcement workers including supervisors	9,264	2%	261.0	\$66,173
Food preparation and serving related occupations	18,642	5%	83.5	\$16,221
Building and grounds cleaning and maintenance occupations	16,446	4%	109.9	\$21,637
Personal care and service occupations	15,004	4%	104.4	\$17,744
Sales and office occupations:	87,908	23%	99.6	\$35,663
Sales and related occupations	28,957	8%	72.9	\$32,373
Office and administrative support occupations	58,951	16%	121.4	\$36,217
Natural resources, construction, and maintenance occupations:	15,135	4%	45.2	\$45,030
Farming, fishing, and forestry occupations	144	0%	5.5	\$18,576
Construction and extraction occupations	7,053	2%	37.0	\$41,932
Installation, maintenance, and repair occupations	7,938	2%	67.5	\$50,146
Production, transportation, and material moving occupations:	47,005	12%	102.2	\$32,882
Production occupations	12,658	3%	58.1	\$40,624
Transportation occupations	19,026	5%	134.2	\$35,706
Material moving occupations	15,321	4%	153.3	\$25,083

Table 8a: Private Sector Wage Disparities by Sector, by Race 2016 for the Baltimore Metropolitan Area

Data Source: American Community Survey, Census Bureau

Occupational Employment - African American Employment	Total	% of Total	Occupational LQ	Overall City 2016 Median Earnings
Civilian employed population 16 years and over	154,998	100%	100.0	\$37,254
Management, business, science, and arts occupations:	45,321	29%	77.8	\$56,110
Management, business, and financial occupations:	16,793	11%	71.5	\$61,782
Management occupations	10,495	7%	65.8	\$62,095
Business and financial operations occupations	6,298	4%	83.5	\$60,389
Computer, engineering, and science occupations:	4,811	3%	54.8	\$66,454
Computer and mathematical occupations	2,510	2%	54.7	\$71,643
Architecture and engineering occupations	1,256	1%	44.2	\$62,816
Life, physical, and social science occupations	1,045	1%	77.3	\$49,467
Education, legal, community service, arts, and media occupations:	15,878	10%	94.9	\$44,247
Community and social services occupations	5,614	4%	210.3	\$41,750
Legal occupations	1,594	1%	91.6	\$75,896
Education, training, and library occupations	6,991	5%	75.8	\$40,086
Arts, design, entertainment, sports, and media occupations	1,679	1%	54.1	\$47,890
Healthcare practitioner and technical occupations:	7,839	5%	84.9	\$56,943
Health diagnosing and treating practitioners and other technical occupations	2,878	2%	46.2	\$66,383
Health technologists and technicians	4,961	3%	165.6	\$30,947
Service occupations:	44,860	29%	160.0	\$22,512
Healthcare support occupations	9,992	6%	273.7	\$27,652
Protective service occupations:	7,844	5%	243.6	\$46,017
Firefighting and prevention, and other protective service workers including supervisors	4,637	3%	262.5	\$29,574
Law enforcement workers including supervisors	3,207	2%	220.5	\$55,810
Food preparation and serving related occupations	10,640	7%	116.4	\$18,076
Building and grounds cleaning and maintenance occupations	8,996	6%	146.7	\$21,003
Personal care and service occupations	7,388	5%	125.5	\$20,801
Sales and office occupations:	37,694	24%	104.2	\$32,253
Sales and related occupations	11,811	8%	72.6	\$26,352
Office and administrative support occupations	25,883	17%	130.1	\$35,207
Natural resources, construction, and maintenance occupations:	7,102	5%	51.8	\$35,232
Farming, fishing, and forestry occupations	0	0%	0.0	\$21,534
Construction and extraction occupations	4,497	3%	57.5	\$36,144
Installation, maintenance, and repair occupations	2,605	2%	54.1	\$31,908
Production, transportation, and material moving occupations:	20,021	13%	106.3	\$28,967
Production occupations	6,266	4%	70.1	\$30,735
Transportation occupations	8,260	5%	142.2	\$31,250
Material moving occupations	5,495	4%	134.2	\$20,729

Table 8b: Private Sector Wage Disparities by Sector, by Race 2016 for Baltimore City

Data Source: American Community Survey, Census Bureau

2

Industry and Occupational Growth Projections and the African American Workforce

In this final section, the JFI uses State of Maryland industry and occupational employment growth projections to assess the impact of expected patterns of employment growth on African American workers.

Industry and Occupational Growth Projections and the African American Workforce

Due to data availability, the definition of Baltimore MSA is different for these projections than that used by the U.S. Census for industry and occupational data analyzed above. According to the U.S. Census, the official definition of the Baltimore-Columbia-Towson Metropolitan Statistical Area (MSA) includes the following core counties: Anne Arundel County; Baltimore City; Baltimore County; Carroll County; Harford County; Howard County; and Queen Anne's County. Projection data available from the Maryland Department of Labor (DLLR) is only available for State designated workforce areas that do not align perfectly to the Census-based definition for the metro area. For the DLLR projections, the Baltimore region is an aggregation of the following workforce areas: Anne Arundel County, Baltimore City, Baltimore County, Mid Maryland (Carroll and Howard counties) and Susquehanna (Harford and Cecil counties) workforce region, and thus, differs slightly from the data analyzed above.

Industries that account for a large share of African American employment and have high concentrations of African American workers have strong growth prospects.

At the industry level, two of four industries that account for a high share of African American employment and have a high LQ for African American workers — health care and social assistance and administrative and support and waste management services — are projected to experience strong growth through 2024; while the retail trade and transportation and warehousing sectors are projected to experience slow to moderate growth. The professional, scientific and technical services sector is expected to continue to lead the region in overall job creation. While the concentration of African American workers in this industry is lower than the national average, this sector does account for a large share of African American employment, and African American employment in this sector grew more rapidly than total sector employment in 2009–16.

At the occupational level however, the projected growth rates are slower in the lower skill occupations that account for a larger share of African American employment.

At the occupational level, the lower skilled occupations that account for a larger share of African American employment and where African American workers also have higher concentrations of employment are generally expected to grow more slowly than higher skill occupations. This may indicate future problems in terms of African American employment growth. Two occupational areas that stand out from this trend are health technologists and technicians and healthcare support occupations, which require at least middle-level skills and offer career advancement opportunities, are both expected to experience more rapid growth.

While projected industry growth trends suggest expanding job opportunities for African American workers, the high concentration of these workers in lower skill occupations can be expected to mitigate future employment growth.

Many of the lower skilled occupations with high concentrations of African American employment are subject to replacement by technology and automation. In contrast, knowledge and creative-based occupations where African American employment is less concentrated, are expected to experience strong growth. As a result, investments in education and job training may be necessary not only to address persistent wage differences but in order to promote continued gains in African American employment.

Table 9a:Projected Private Sector Employment Growth by Sector, 2014–2024 for the Baltimore
Metropolitan Area

Industries - African American Employment	Total	% of Total	Industry LQ	Projected Sector Growth 2014-2024
Civilian employed population 14 years and over	<u>319,436</u>	100%		<u>6%</u>
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting, and mining:	211	0.1%	4.4	12%
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting	149	0.0%	4.9	5%
Mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction	62	0.0%	3.6	16%
Construction	10,063	3%	58.5	6%
Manufacturing	11,623	4%	35.0	(3%)
Wholesale trade	10,744	3%	68.4	0%
Retail trade	45,638	14%	108.7	4%
Transportation and warehousing, and utilities:	20,245	6%	143.0	5%
Transportation and warehousing	19,330	6%	152.6	6%
Utilities	915	0%	61.6	(1%)
Information	5,130	2%	65.1	7%
Finance and insurance, and real estate and rental and leasing:	18,273	6%	85.8	9%
Finance and insurance	11,202	4%	71.4	9%
Real estate and rental and leasing	7,071	2%	126.0	9%
Professional, scientific, and management, and administrative and waste management services:	64,547	20%	120.8	11%
Professional, scientific, and technical services	18,999	6%	80.3	12%
Management of companies and enterprises	3,933	1%	61.8	4%
Administrative and support and waste management services	41,615	13%	177.7	10%
Educational services, and health care and social assistance:	87,791	27%	151.8	11%
Educational services	8,820	3%	115.8	7%
Health care and social assistance	78,971	25%	157.3	16%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation, and accommodation and food services:	36,199	11%	89.6	5%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation	5,664	2%	101.3	6%
Accommodation and food services	30,535	10%	87.7	5%
Other services, except public administration	8,972	3%	78.0	5%

Industries - African American Employment	Total	% of Total	Industry LQ	Projected Sector Growth 2014-2024
Civilian employed population 14 years and over	<u>99,503</u>	100%		<u>8%</u>
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting, and mining:	42	0%	2.8	17%
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting	21	0%	2.2	0%
Mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction	21	0%	4.0	17%
Construction	2,790	3%	52.0	(5%)
Manufacturing	3,068	3%	29.6	(28%)
Wholesale trade	2,310	2%	47.2	8%
Retail trade	16,761	17%	128.2	3%
Transportation and warehousing, and utilities:	3,299	3%	74.8	5%
Transportation and warehousing	2,922	3%	74.0	4%
Utilities	377	0%	81.5	8%
Information	2,089	2%	85.1	(9%)
Finance and insurance, and real estate and rental and leasing:	7,625	8%	114.9	12%
Finance and insurance	5,326	5%	109.0	3%
Real estate and rental and leasing	2,299	2%	131.6	13%
Professional, scientific, and management, and administrative and waste management services:	20,063	20%	120.5	9%
Professional, scientific, and technical services	4,554	5%	61.8	11%
Management of companies and enterprises	968	1%	48.8	5%
Administrative and support and waste management services	14,541	15%	199.3	8%
Educational services, and health care and social assistance:	29,512	30%	163.8	13%
Educational services	1,396	1%	58.8	13%
Health care and social assistance	28,116	28%	179.7	11%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation, and accommodation and food services:	9,741	10%	77.4	4%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation	1,226	1%	70.4	6%
Accommodation and food services	8,515	9%	78.5	(19%)
Other services, except public administration	2,203	2%	61.4	10%

Table 9b: Projected Private Sector Employment Growth by Sector, 2014–2024 for Baltimore City

Occupational Employment - African American	Total	% of Total	Occupational LQ	Projected Occupational Employment Growth 2014- 2024
Civilian employed population 16 years and over	378,343	100%	100.0	6%
Management, business, science, and arts occupations:	137,222	36%	96.5	7%
Management, business, and financial occupations:	49,515	13%	86.3	8%
Management occupations	28,674	8%	73.6	7%
Business and financial operations occupations	20,841	6%	113.2	9%
Computer, engineering, and science occupations:	21,051	6%	98.2	10%
Computer and mathematical occupations	13,929	4%	124.3	14%
Architecture and engineering occupations	4,747	1%	68.5	5%
Life, physical, and social science occupations	2,375	1%	72.0	7%
Education, legal, community service, arts, and media occupations:	39,129	10%	95.8	5%
Community and social services occupations	12,373	3%	189.9	6%
Legal occupations	3,520	1%	82.9	2%
Education, training, and library occupations	17,485	5%	77.7	6%
Arts, design, entertainment, sports, and media occupations	5,751	2%	75.9	5%
Healthcare practitioner and technical occupations:	27,527	7%	122.2	12%
Health diagnosing and treating practitioners and other technical occupations	15,548	4%	102.2	13%
Health technologists and technicians	11,979	3%	163.8	10%
Service occupations:	91,073	24%	133.1	7%
Healthcare support occupations	20,754	5%	232.9	14%
Protective service occupations:	20,227	5%	257.3	3%
Firefighting and prevention, and other protective service workers including supervisors	10,963	3%	254.3	1%
Law enforcement workers including supervisors	9,264	2%	261.0	4%
Food preparation and serving related occupations	18,642	5%	83.5	5%
Building and grounds cleaning and maintenance occupations	16,446	4%	109.9	7%
Personal care and service occupations	15,004	4%	104.4	9%
Sales and office occupations:	87,908	23%	99.6	3%
Sales and related occupations	28,957	8%	72.9	4%
Office and administrative support occupations	58,951	16%	121.4	2%
Natural resources, construction, and maintenance occupations:	15,135	4%	45.2	7%
Farming, fishing, and forestry occupations	144	0%	5.5	1%
Construction and extraction occupations	7,053	2%	37.0	8%
Installation, maintenance, and repair occupations	7,938	2%	67.5	6%
Production, transportation, and material moving occupations:	47,005	12%	102.2	6%
Production occupations	12,658	3%	58.1	0%
Transportation occupations	19,026	5%	134.2	9%
Material moving occupations	15,321	4%	153.3	7%

Table 10a: Projected Occupational Employment Growth 2014–2024 for the Baltimore Metropolitan Area

Occupational Employment - African American	Total	% of Total	Occupational LQ	Projected Occupational Employment Growth 2014-2024
Civilian employed population 16 years and over	154,998	<u>100%</u>	100.0	8%
Management, business, science, and arts occupations:	45,321	29%	77.8	11%
Management, business, and financial occupations:	16,793	11%	71.5	11%
Management occupations	10,495	7%	65.8	10%
Business and financial operations occupations	6,298	4%	83.5	13%
Computer, engineering, and science occupations:	4,811	3%	54.8	14%
Computer and mathematical occupations	2,510	2%	54.7	16%
Architecture and engineering occupations	1,255	1%	44.2	11%
Life, physical, and social science occupations	1,045	1%	77.3	12%
Education, legal, community service, arts, and media occupations:	15,878	10%	94.9	8%
Community and social services occupations	5,614	4%	210.3	10%
Legal occupations	1,594	1%	91.6	5%
Education, training, and library occupations	6,991	5%	75.8	9%
Arts, design, entertainment, sports, and media occupations	1,679	1%	54.1	6%
Healthcare practitioner and technical occupations:	7,839	5%	84.9	14%
Health diagnosing and treating practitioners and other technical occupations	2,878	2%	46.2	15%
Health technologists and technicians	4,961	3%	165.6	11%
Service occupations:	44,860	29%	160.0	7%
Healthcare support occupations	9,992	6%	273.7	13%
Protective service occupations:	7,844	5%	243.6	4%
Firefighting and prevention, and other protective service workers including supervisors	4,637	3%	262.5	1%
Law enforcement workers including supervisors	3,207	2%	220.5	4%
Food preparation and serving related occupations	10,640	7%	116.4	7%
Building and grounds cleaning and maintenance occupations	8,996	6%	146.7	7%
Personal care and service occupations	7,388	5%	125.5	6%
Sales and office occupations:	37,694	24%	104.2	3%
Sales and related occupations	11,811	8%	72.6	4%
Office and administrative support occupations	25,883	17%	130.1	3%
Natural resources, construction, and maintenance occupations:	7,102	5%	51.8	7%
Farming, fishing, and forestry occupations	0	0%	0.0	5%
Construction and extraction occupations	4,497	3%	57.5	10%
Installation, maintenance, and repair occupations	2,605	2%	54.1	5%
Production, transportation, and material moving occupations:	20,021	13%	106.3	8%
Production occupations	6,265	4%	70.1	(3%)
Transportation occupations	8,260	5%	142.2	16%
Material moving occupations	5,495	4%	134.2	8%

Table 10b: Projected Occupational Employment Growth 2014-2024 for Baltimore City



1114 Cathedral Street Baltimore, MD 21201 410.659.0000 www.abc-md.org